

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
WESTERN DIVISION

SANDRA GIVENS, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

CASE NO. 1:10-CV-382

-vs-

Judge Timothy S. Black

PAUL F. WENKER *et al.*,

Defendants.

---

**JUDGMENT IN A CIVIL CASE**

---

[ ] **Jury Verdict:** This action came before the Court for a trial by jury. The issues have been tried and the Jury has rendered its verdict.

[X] **Decision by Court:** This action came to trial or hearing before the Court. The issues have been tried or heard and a decision has been rendered,

**IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED** that the Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. 50) is **GRANTED**; and that the case is **CLOSED** from the docket of the Court.

Date: May 14, 2012

**JAMES BONINI, CLERK**

By: s/M. Rogers  
Deputy Clerk